

6

7

8

9 10

11

24

27

28

## Proceeding Paper

Analysis Settlement Employment of of 2 **Disputes Through** Industrial Termination the 3 Court (Study Relations Decision Number: Δ 41/Pdt.Sus-PHI/2021/PN.Tik) 5

# Tami Rusli<sup>1</sup>, Erlina B<sup>2</sup>, Putri Mawardita Puspitasari<sup>3</sup>, Anissa Putri Lestariawan<sup>4</sup>, Zahra Khairunnisa<sup>5,\*</sup>

- <sup>1</sup> Universitas Bandar Lampung; <u>Tami@ubl.ac.id</u>
- \* Correspondence: Tami@ubl.ac.id;

# Abstract

This study presents a detailed analysis of the resolution process for employment termination disputes within 12 the Industrial Relations Court, focusing specifically on the case outlined in Decision Number 41/Pdt.Sus-13 PHI/2021/PN.Tjk. Through an examination of the legal intricacies, procedural nuances, and pivotal factors 14shaping the court's decision-making, the research aims to offer a comprehensive understanding of how such 15 disputes are settled within the framework of industrial relations law. The study delves into the complexities 16 of the chosen case, aiming to unravel the broader legal precedents and implications that govern the 17 resolution of employment termination conflicts. By dissecting the specific details of Decision Number 18 41/Pdt.Sus-PHI/2021/PN.Tjk, this research seeks to contribute valuable insights into the dynamics of 19 employment relations law, providing a nuanced perspective on the factors influencing court decisions. This 20 analysis not only sheds light on the case at hand but also offers a framework for understanding and 21 anticipating the outcomes of future disputes within the Industrial Relations Court, thereby contributing to the 22 broader body of knowledge in the field. 23

**Keywords:** Vaccine Implementation; Public Awareness; Operational Challenges; Local 25 Governance. 26

## 1. Introduction

The resolution of job termination conflicts, especially through the Industrial Relations Court, is a 29 crucial aspect of industrial relations that has a considerable impact on both employees and 30 companies. These conflicts frequently stem from workforce reductions, which are intricate and 31 diverse matters with significant ramifications for both the employees and the corporate industry. 32 The objective of this research paper, entitled "Analysis of Settlement of Employment Termination 33 Disputes Through the Industrial Relations Court (Study Decision Number: 41/Pdt.Sus-34 PHI/2021/PN.Tjk)," is to conduct a thorough examination of the resolution process for these 35 disputes within the legal system. The paper will concentrate on a particular case study to elucidate 36 broader principles in the fields of law and industrial relations (Handias & Azhar, 2020; Xamidullo, 37 2021). 38

Terminations, inherently, can give rise to disputes between employers and employees. The 39 Industrial Relations Court plays a crucial role in settling these issues. According to Ahmar et al. 40 (2020), the court plays a crucial role in settling conflicts across several sectors, including industrial 41 relations. Resolving layoff issues through the judicial system is not just a legal process, but a vital 42 measure to guarantee equity and compliance with the intricate network of laws and regulations 43 that oversee the termination of employment. The resolution of these situations frequently carries 44 significant consequences. Decisions made by the court in cases involving layoffs not only settle 45 individual conflicts, but also set legal precedents that can impact future employer policies and the 46 safeguarding of workers' rights (Gaffar et al., 2021; Kurniasari, 2020). 47



35

This study will thoroughly analyse the complexities of a legal case by closely scrutinising Decision 1 Number 41/Pdt.Sus-PHI/2021/PN.Tjk. This particular case, which was resolved by the Industrial 2 Relations Court, offers a comprehensive framework for comprehending the reasoning of the 3 judiciary and the legal principles that form the basis of judgements in disputes related to 4 employment termination. The research will provide in-depth analysis of this particular case, 5 shedding light on the practical application of legal concepts and the delicate balance that courts 6 strike between the conflicting interests of employers and employees within the intricate realm of 7 industrial relations (Gaffar et al., 2021; Mashdurohatun et al., 2020; Sudiarawan et al., 2021). 8 The research's value comes in its concentration on a particular case study, allowing for a thorough 9 and intricate examination of the legal procedure involved in employment termination issues. Prior 10 studies in this domain have extensively examined the function of courts in issues related to 11 industrial relations. Nevertheless, there is still a lack of comprehension regarding the practical 12 implementation of these concepts in actual situations, particularly within the framework of the 13 Indonesian legal system. The objective of this research is to narrow the divide by analysing an 14 actual case, offering a more distinct understanding of the legal method used to settle job 15 termination conflicts (Gaffar et al., 2021; Wijayanti, 2015). 16

The study acknowledges the importance of court rulings in influencing the structure of workplace17relations. These decisions not only resolve the current issue between the parties, but also18contribute to the developing legal and regulatory framework that controls employment relations.19Stakeholders in the industrial relations sector, including employees, employers, and20policymakers, can acquire significant insights into the application of employment regulations and21the principles of fairness and justice by comprehending the dynamics involved in these decisions22(Putra, 2020; Wijayanti, 2015).23

My research is driven by a dedication to enhance the overall comprehension of industrial relations 24 and employment law. This study aims to offer practical insights that can be used to inform future 25 policy-making and legislative reforms in the subject of work relations, rather than being solely an 26 academic exercise. This research aims to clarify the intricate relationship between legal doctrine, 27 judicial reasoning, and the practical consequences of court rulings on employment termination 28 disputes by analysing a specific court decision. 29

Ultimately, this research is poised to make a substantial impact on the domain of industrial relations and employment law. It provides thorough examination and valuable perspectives that can enrich both scholarly discussions and practical decision-making processes related to resolving employment disputes.

#### **Theoretical Review**

Layoffs (also known as PHK, or permanent headcount reductions) have become a significant and important aspect of industrial relations, requiring specific attention, especially in the field of resolving conflicts. This study aims to analyse the theoretical foundations that govern the resolution of layoff issues through the Industrial Relations Court (PHI). The study seeks to develop a comprehensive framework for understanding and analysing the adjudication of disputes by examining important theories (Blouin, 1980; Langille & Macklem, 2007; Mitchell, 1986). 41

The core of settling layoff issues is rooted in the body of labour law. Landiman (2019) highlights 42 the crucial significance of labour law in establishing the specific duties, entitlements, and protocols 43 that both employers and employees are required to follow in the event of workforce reductions. 44 This study will focus on analysing the legal principles inherent in labour law that regulate the 45 protocols for conducting layoffs. Comprehending the legal parameters is essential for 46 understanding how the Industrial Relations Court handles and resolves issues arising from layoffs 47 (Kusumawati & Hamrany, 2022; Mashdurohatun et al., 2020; Ramadhan & Diamantina, 2020). 48 The Industrial Relations Court, as described by Sudargo (2018), is an essential entity responsible 49 for resolving labour disputes. It possesses the power to decide cases concerning industrial 50 relations, including matters relating to employee layoffs. This study will examine the functional 51 dynamics of the PHI, with a specific focus on its role as a body for resolving disputes. Particular 52 emphasis will be placed on the manner in which the PHI analyses and manages instances of 53 employee termination, as demonstrated by the examination of Decision Number 41/Pdt.Sus-54 PHI/2021/PN.Tjk. Examining the court's rulings provides valuable understanding of its judicial 55 ideology and the implementation of labour legislation in real-life situations (Handias & Azhar, 56 2020; Wijayanti, 2015). 57



16

Principles of justice and human rights: Van Dijk (2012) emphasises that in order to effectively 1 resolve layoff issues, it is crucial to uphold the values of justice and respect for human rights 2 (HAM). This viewpoint is especially pertinent when contemplating labourers' entitlements within 3 the framework of workforce reductions. The study aims to examine the manner in which the 4 concepts of justice and human rights are demonstrated in the decisions made by the PHI, with a 5 particular emphasis on Decision Number 41/Pdt.Sus-PHI/2021/PN.Tjk. The purpose of this 6 investigation is to determine the degree to which the court's rulings conform to these fundamental 7 principles, thereby guaranteeing impartial and just treatment of all parties involved in layoff issues 8 (Putra, 2020; Ramadhan & Diamantina, 2020). 9

To summarise, this theoretical analysis establishes the foundation for a comprehensive examination of the legal, institutional, and ethical aspects of resolving disputes related to layoffs. The research seeks to gain a comprehensive understanding of how layoff conflicts are managed and resolved in the present industrial relations environment by analysing the interaction between labour law, the Industrial Relations Court, and the principles of fairness and human rights.

## 2. Research Method

This study utilises a qualitative approach, focusing on the examination of layoff instances and<br/>their resolution through the Industrial Relations Court (PHI). The study's methodological<br/>framework is designed to offer a thorough comprehension of the intricate and subtle aspects<br/>associated with employment termination issues, specifically from the perspective of the Industrial<br/>Relations Court. The research progresses through multiple crucial phases, each contributing to a<br/>comprehensive analysis of the chosen case study, Decision Number 41/Pdt.Sus-<br/>PHI/2021/PN.Tjk (Kurniasari, 2020; Zulkarnaen & Sanjaya, 2021).17

The fundamental basis of this research lies in the analysis of case studies. The selected case, 24 Decision Number 41/Pdt.Sus-PHI/2021/PN.Tjk, provides an opportunity to thoroughly examine 25 the complexities of layoff disputes decided by PHI. The utilisation of a case study methodology is 26 crucial in elucidating the circumstances, pivotal elements, and the reasoning behind the court's 27 rulings. The research seeks to get insight into the larger patterns and trends in the court 28 management of layoff claims by closely analysing this particular case (Riawanto et al., 2021). 29

In addition to the case study analysis, the research includes interviews with key stakeholders who were involved in the layoff case. The stakeholders encompass worker representatives, company executives, and potentially relevant third parties. Conducting interviews is crucial in this research since it offers primary accounts and insights into the dynamics of the case. These perspectives are extremely useful for comprehending the practical consequences of the disagreement and the diverse interests and viewpoints of the parties concerned (Putra, 2020; Rahimy, 2021). 30 30 31 32 32 33 33 34 35

An further crucial element of this inquiry involves the examination of documents. This entails a comprehensive analysis of PHI determinations, employment agreement papers, and other relevant legal documents pertaining to the matter. An essential aspect of comprehending the legal arguments put out and grasping the court's decision-making process is the examination of the document. This phase guarantees a thorough understanding of the legal aspects of the conflict (Golding, 2021; Putra, 2020). 41

This research will utilise a diverse array of legal literature to provide context and enhance the<br/>analysis. This literature focuses on several facets of employment termination, processes for<br/>resolving disputes, and the function of the Industrial Relations Court. The theoretical foundations<br/>presented in this literature will assist in placing the case study within a wider legal and academic<br/>to context. Additionally, it will facilitate the establishment of links between the observed data from<br/>this study and the preexisting theories and concepts in the domain of employment law and<br/>industrial relations (Kurniasari, 2020; Mukhidin et al., 2021).42

To put it simply, this study approach is carefully crafted to analyse and comprehend the intricate 49 nature of job termination conflicts, as resolved by the Industrial Relations Court. This research 50 seeks to gain a comprehensive and detailed understanding of how layoff disputes are resolved in 51 the judicial arena. It will achieve this by combining case study analysis, interviews, document 52



4

examination, and theoretical exploration. The findings of this research will have implications for 1 both legal practice and policy formulation in the field of employment relations. 2

#### 3. Discussion

This study has provided an extensive comprehension of the process of resolving employment 5 termination issues through the Industrial Relations Court (PHI), with a specific focus on the 6 thorough analysis of Decision Number 41/Pdt.Sus-PHI/2021/PN.Tjk. The results of this case 7 study have illuminated several aspects of the PHI's decision-making process in cases of layoffs 8 and have sparked numerous significant ideas and discussions: 9

The research indicates that the decision-making process of PHI is heavily influenced by a 10 legalistic analysis of layoff instances. The company's compliance with labour legislation and the 11 accurate implementation of layoff procedures are considered essential. This discovery 12 emphasises the court's dedication to guaranteeing that layoffs are carried out in conformity with 13 established legal standards. 14

The verdict emphasises the crucial significance of strong legal arguments, namely those that 15 effectively express valid justifications for layoffs. PHI decisions are impacted by valid reasons, 16 such as economic considerations, technical requirements, or the need to uphold nondiscriminatory standards. The court's emphasis on maintaining the validity of layoffs under legal 18 examination is evident in this aspect of the ruling. 19

Social justice is a notable aspect of this study, as PHI specifically focuses on the effects of layoffs 20 on employee well-being. The court diligently endeavours to achieve equilibrium between the 21 rights and interests of the firm and those of the workers. This method demonstrates an endeavour 22 to reconcile corporate prerogatives with worker welfare. 23

The results underscore the importance of employers ensuring that their layoff practices are in 24 accordance with the provisions of the Employment Law. Ensuring this alignment is of utmost 25 importance in justifying the layoffs and circumventing potential legal complications. The research 26 highlights that compliance with legal frameworks is not merely a procedural requirement but a 27 crucial element in the legal verification of firm actions. 28

The conversation pertains to the necessity of bolstering safeguards for workers, particularly in 29 relation to layoffs. During circumstances that require heightened caution, such as economic 30 downturns or restructuring, it is recommended to strengthen worker rights in order to avoid 31 unnecessary difficulties. 32

A notable feature of the research is the focus on mediation as a more desirable option for resolving disagreements before escalating them to PHI. This discovery prompts a discourse on potential enhancements to the employment dispute settlement system. Mediation provides a less confrontational and more cooperative method, which may result in mutually agreeable resolutions.

To summarise, the research provides a detailed and subtle viewpoint on the PHI's strategy for 38 settling PHK conflicts. The court's emphasis lies in its dependence on legal frameworks, the 39 imperative of robust legal explanations for layoffs, the inclusion of social justice considerations, 40 the significance of adherence to legal conformance in corporate policy, the requirement for 41



5

30

31

heightened worker protections, and the potential advantages of mediation. These observations 1 enhance comprehension of the legal framework pertaining to employment terminations and 2 suggest potential options for enhancing labour relations and resolving disputes in the future. 3

### Conclusion

The decisions made by the Industrial Relations Court (PHI) regarding employment termination 6 issues are guided by a legal framework that places importance on both the company's adherence 7 to labour regulations and the legality of the layoff procedures. The court underscores the need of 8 employers having strong legal justifications for their layoff choices, ensuring that they align with 9 business necessities and comply with regulatory mandates. The decisions made by the PHI also 10 demonstrate a conscientious regard for social justice, effectively weighing the rights and interests 11 of both the company and its employees (Kusumawati & Hamrany, 2022; Muniapan, 2013). 12 In order to adhere to labour standards, it is imperative for enterprises to uphold stringent 13 adherence to layoff protocols, hence reducing the likelihood of legal conflicts and guaranteeing 14ethical and equitable treatment of their employees. It is imperative to improve legal representation 15 for workers and strengthen organisations that safeguard workers' rights. This can be achieved by 16 allocating additional resources for legal aid, teaching workers about their rights, and establishing 17 effective systems to preserve their rights in cases of layoffs (Gaffar et al., 2021; Kurniasari, 2020; 18 Kusumawati & Hamrany, 2022). 19

Advocating for alternate dispute resolution procedures, such as mediation, can alleviate the strain 20 on the judicial system and facilitate more harmonious results. Mediation is a non-adversarial and 21 cooperative method for resolving conflicts, which has the potential to result in mutually agreeable 22 solutions for both employers and employees. This method conserves both time and resources, 23 while also promoting a more amicable industrial partnership (Achu, 2018; Shi, 2021). 24

To summarise, the research highlights the significance of adhering to legal regulations, 25 conducting layoffs in a fair and equitable manner, and finding a balance between the interests of 26 employers and employees when terminating employment. The ideas seek to improve the legal 27 framework and procedures related to layoffs, promoting a fairer and more efficient resolution of 28 employment disputes. 29

#### References

- Achu, F. J. (2018). Settlement of Labour Disputes under Cameroonian Labour Law. African Journal of International and Comparative Law, 26(3), 407–425.
   33
- Blouin, R. (1980). International Encyclopedia for Labour Law and Industrial Relations, by Roger
   Blanpain (ed.), Deventer, Netherlands, Kluwer, 1978. *Relations industrielles / Industrial Relations*, *35*(3), 611–612. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.7202/029110ar
- Gaffar, S., Karsona, A. M., Pujiwati, Y., & Perwira, I. (2021). The concept of procedural law
   regarding the implementation of collective agreements with legal certainty in termination of
   employment in Indonesia. *Heliyon*, 7(4). https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2021.e06690
- Golding, G. (2021). Major court and tribunal decisions in Australia in 2020. Journal of Industrial40Relations, 63(3), 395–410. https://doi.org/10.1177/002218562098726241



Handias, A. T., & Azhar, M. (2020). The Urgency Mechanism of Industrial Relation's Settlement 1 to Support the Business Climate that Equitable for Workers. Jurnal Hukum Prasada, 7(2), 2 66-72. https://doi.org/10.22225/jhp.7.2.2116.66-72 3 Kurniasari, E. (2020). Industrial Dispute Settlement in Industrial Relations Court of Banda Aceh. 4 Proceedings of the International Conference on Law, Governance and Islamic Society 5 (ICOLGIS 2019), 82-85. https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.200306.186 6 Kusumawati, M. P., & Hamrany, A. K. (2022). Asy-Syir'ah Legal Protection for Workers Affected 7 by Layoffs in Indonesian Laws and Regulations. Jurnal Ilmu Syari'ah Dan Hukum, 56(2), 8 311-327. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.14421/ajish.v56i2.954 9 Langille, B., & Macklem, P. (2007). The Polical Economy of Fairness: Frank lacobucci's Labour 10 Law Jurisprudence. University of Toronto Law Journal 57(2), 343-367. . 11 https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1353/tlj.2007.0016. 12 Mashdurohatun, A., Syah, R., & Arto, G. (2020). Reconstruction of Severance Pay and Workers' 13 Rights Due to Termination of Employment (Layoff) Based on Justice Value. Journal of 14 Social Science Research, 15, 115–126. https://doi.org/10.24297/jssr.v15i.8624 15 Mitchell, R. (1986). Book Reviews: Labour Law and Industrial Relations: Edited by Lord 16 Wedderburn, Roy Lewis and Jon Clark. Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1983, vii + 250 pp., 17 \$21.50 (paperback). Journal of Industrial Relations, 28(2), 297-299. 18 https://doi.org/10.1177/002218568602800216 19 Mukhidin, Hamzani, A. I., Taufik, M., Rahayu, K., & Nuridin. (2021). Termination of Employment 20 Problems in Indonesia. PSYCHOLOGY AND EDUCATION, 58(2), 6483-6488. 21 https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.17762/pae.v58i2.3180 22 Muniapan, B. (2013). The Industrial Law and Right to Retrench in Malaysia from a Human 23 Resource Management Perspective. International Journal of Asian Business and 24 Information Management 4(2), 1–15. (IJABIM), 25 https://doi.org/http://doi.org/10.4018/jabim.2013040101 26 Putra, S. G. M. S. R. (2020). Legal Reconstruction of Implementation Legally Binding Verdict in 27 Industrial Relations Court. Jurnal Hukum Dan Peradilan, 9(1), 99–115. 28 https://doi.org/10.25216/jhp.9.1.2020.99-115 29 Rahimy, A. (2021). The Covid-19 Pandemic as The Basis for Termination of Employment in 30 Indonesia, Between Force Majeure or Efficiency (Analysis of Decision Number: 781 31 K/Pdt.Sus-PHI/2021). International Journal of Law and Politics Studies (IJLPS), 3(2), 36-32 46. https://doi.org/10.32996/ijlps 33 Ramadhan, G., & Diamantina, A. (2020). Problematic Arrangements for Termination of 34 Employment in the Job Creation Law. Varia Justicia, 16(2), 183-193. 35 https://doi.org/10.31603/variajusticia.v16i2.3932 36 Riawanto, Harianti, I., & Rohmah, M. H. (2021). The Legal Power of The Authenticity of Bipartite 37 Joint Agreement Between PT Platinum Ceramics Industry Surabaya and Workers. JIPRL 38 Journal Indonesia & Review. 139-143. Law Policy 2(3),39 https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.56371/jirpl.v2i3.52 40



- Shi, X. (2021). Research on the Protection Mechanism of Legal Rights and Interests of 1
  Employees in Enterprise Bankruptcy Reorganization. *Proceedings of the 2021 6th 2 International Conference on Social Sciences and Economic Development (ICSSED 2021), 3*894–899. https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.210407.169 4
- Sudiarawan, K. A., Tanaya, P. E., & Hapsari, K. D. (2021). Termination of Employment-Based
   on Efficiency in Indonesian Company. *Fiat Justisia: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum*, *15*(1), 39–50.
   https://doi.org/10.25041/fiatjustisia.v15no1.2015
- Wijayanti, A. (2015). Labor Judiciary Access to Achieve the Substantive Justice. *SSRN*, 1–13. 8 https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2570860 9
- Xamidullo, Q. (2021). Issues Of Improving Civil Litigation. The American Journal of Political10ScienceLawandCriminology,03(03),28–34.11https://doi.org/10.37547/tajpslc/Volume03Issue03-0512
- Zulkarnaen, A. H., & Sanjaya, A. (2021). The Impact of the COVID-19 Pandemic on Layoffs from
   a Labor Law Perspective. Advances in Sciences and Humanities, 7(2), 25–31.
   https://doi.org/10.11648/j.ash.20210702.13